



**CORAL TRIANGLE INITIATIVE  
ON CORAL REEFS, FISHERIES AND FOOD SECURITY (CTI-CFF)  
REGIONAL ECOSYSTEM APPROACH TO FISHERIES MANAGEMENT (EAFM)  
TECHNICAL WORKING GROUP (TWG)**

---

**MINUTES OF MEETING**

Third CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting  
May 14-16, 2013  
Mercure Sanur, Bali, Indonesia

**BACKGROUND**

The overall objective of the 3<sup>rd</sup> EAFM TWG Meeting was to address Regional Plan of Action (RPOA) Goal 2 (Ecosystem Approach to Management of Fisheries (EAFM) and other Marine Resources Fully Applied) and specifically Target 1 (Strong legislative, policy and regulatory frameworks in place for achieving an ecosystem approach to fisheries management (EAFM), Regional Action 1 (Collaborate to develop a “common regional framework for legislation and policy” that would support EAFM drawing on this , strengthen regional and national legislation, policies, and regulations) by 2012.

The 3<sup>rd</sup> CTI-CFF Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management Technical Working Group (EAFM TWG) Meeting was held Mercure Sanur, Bali, Indonesia from May 14<sup>th</sup>-16<sup>th</sup> 2013 and was attended by delegates from Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Solomon Islands and Timor Leste as well as support partners from US CTI Support Program team and observers as per participants’ list in [Annex 1](#). Papua New Guinea (PNG) has initially indicated of attending the meeting but eventually had to beg off due to logistical reasons.

**DAY ONE**

**OPENING CEREMONIES**

1. Mr. Rayner Stuel Galid, the Chair of the CTI-CFF EAFM TWG opened the meeting expressing his thanks to all CT6 delegates for attending the meeting. He emphasized the TWG that there a number of long-standing items in the agenda that he is hopeful can be moved forward with concrete steps and actions. He also especially expressed his thanks to Indonesia for hosting the meeting.
2. Mr. Eko Rudianto, Vice Chair for Coordination and External Affairs gave remarks on behalf of Dr. Sudirman Saad, the Chair of the CTI Interim Regional Secretariat. He pointed out the significance of this meeting and recognized the progress made by the EAFM TWG. The full text of his message is attached as [Annex 2](#).

3. Dr. Viktor Nikijuluw, the Executive Secretary of NCC Indonesia delivered welcoming remarks and expressed his thanks to the delegates for their attendance to this meeting. He reiterated the importance of EAFM goal (one of the 5 goals under of the CTI-CFF RPOA) as this is the vehicle to accomplish impact in terms of fisheries and food security.
4. Dr. Gellwyn Jusuf, Director General of Capture Fisheries of the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (MMAF) delivered his Keynote Address. This was delivered at the resumption of the meeting after lunch. Dr. Jusuf encouraged the EAFM TWG to move forward with the key decisions needed for this meeting so this can be translated into implementation plans at the national and local levels. The full text of Dr. Jusuf's Keynote Address is attached as [Annex 3](#).

#### **Agenda Item 1: Organization of the Meeting**

5. The EAFM TWG Chair, Mr Galid reiterated the key decision points discussed during the pre-council meeting and the need to organize the "drafting committee" to be composed of a representative from each country to prepare the minutes of the meeting for finalization and adoption by the EAFM TWG at the last day. The CT6 representatives agreed to nominate the following members of the "drafting committee:" Imam Musthofa (Indonesia); Tan Geik Hong (Malaysia); Jessica Muñoz (Philippines); Fernando da Silva (Timor Leste) and Peter Kenilorea (Solomon Islands). The committee's task is to a) prepare/review the minutes of the meeting; b) convene on the last day to finalize the minutes; c) present the minutes to the EAFM TWG for adoption.
6. The Chair presented the draft meeting agenda and sought comments from the CT6 representatives for any additional agenda items the meeting wishes to include. After discussion and amendments, the final agenda for the meeting was accepted ([Annex 4](#)).

#### **Agenda Item 2: Reports**

7. The Meeting reviewed and approved the minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting held in May 2012 without amendments ([Annex 5, pages 78-88](#)).
8. The Meeting noted that issues arising from the 2<sup>nd</sup> CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting are considered in the 3<sup>rd</sup> CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting Agenda except the conduct of the 4<sup>th</sup> EAFM Regional Exchange (REX). The Meeting took note that the Agenda of the 3<sup>rd</sup> EAFM TWG Meeting primarily covered all the outstanding items mentioned in the minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting.

##### *a) Matters Arising from the Minutes*

On Para 2.e (4<sup>th</sup> CTI Regional Exchange on EAFM (EAFM REX 4), the meeting was informed that the members countries have decided during the intercessional period to convene the Third Meeting of CTI-CFF EAFM TWG *in lieu* of a 4<sup>th</sup> CTI Regional Exchange on EAFM.

9. The Meeting also considered the proceedings of the 3<sup>rd</sup> EAFM Regional Exchange held Putrajaya, Malaysia in May 2012 and accepted the Activity Report as is ([Annex 5 full document](#)).

### **Agenda Item 3: CT Country Reports on National EAFM Initiatives and Activities**

10. All countries (except PNG (absent)) presented their reports on national EAFM initiatives and activities. These reports are attached as [Annexes 6a](#), [6b](#), [6c](#) and [6d](#):
11. The meeting agreed to the following matters that were brought up in connection with the above mentioned reports:
- a) Papua New Guinea (absent) and Solomon Island (no written report) are kindly requested to submit their respective country reports after the meeting to the TWG Secretariat.
  - b) All CT 6 countries may update their country reports respectively by sending their reports to the TWG Secretariat any time after the meeting.

### **Agenda Item 4: EAFM Regional Framework**

12. The EAFM Regional Framework was reconsidered ([Annex 7](#)). Those present – Indonesia, Malaysia, Solomon Islands, Philippines and Timor Leste - reiterated their endorsement of the EAFM Framework. PNG through Rachel Rabi ([rrabi@fisheries.gov.pg](mailto:rrabi@fisheries.gov.pg)) has sent PNG's endorsement via email stating that "Management has gone through the revised draft version of the EAFM regional framework and have agreed and now endorse the framework" and attached as [Annex 8](#). With PNG's written endorsement, the Meeting adopted the EAFM TWG Framework.

### **Agenda Item 5: EAFM Regional Framework Roadmap**

13. The Chair recognized Dr. Robert Pomeroy to present the EAFM Regional Framework Roadmap ([at page 6 of Annex 7](#) - the EAFM Regional Framework). The Meeting noted that the timelines for the activities in the regional roadmap need to be matched with reference to the countries respective national EAFM roadmaps. The Meeting agreed to suspend discussion on these timelines until all countries have finalized their respective national EAFM roadmaps. The CT6 representatives are requested to submit their respective national EAFM roadmaps by mid-September 2013.

### **Agenda Item 6: 10-year CT6 Country Roadmaps to Implement the EAFM Regional Framework**

14. The Chair recognized Dr. Robert Pomeroy to introduce the basis for the formulation of the 10-year Country Roadmaps. The presentation ([Annex 9](#)) basically reiterates the 5 Key Objectives outlined in the EAFM Regional Framework.

15. The Meeting agreed that the CT6 representatives need to consult their respective countries to develop their national roadmap based on the EAFM Regional Framework.
16. The Meeting expressed commitment to flesh out more detailed activity to implement the Objectives in the EAFM Regional Framework and agreed revisit the timeline in the EAFM Regional Framework to make the implementation realistic and update the TWG in the next meeting.

**Agenda Item 7: CTI Live Reef Food Fish Multi-Stakeholders Forum and the Report on the Live Reef Food Fish Trade (LRFFT) Inter-Governmental Forum**

17. The Chair recognized Mr. Eko Rudianto of the Interim Regional Secretariat to present the outcomes from the LRFFT Inter-Governmental Forum held on 31<sup>st</sup> January- 1<sup>st</sup> February 2013 in Bangkok, Thailand. The presentation is attached as [Annex 10](#) and the full report is attached as [Annex 11](#).
18. The Meeting agreed that EAFM focal points will follow up with their respective NCCs on the action requested by the Interim Regional Secretariat indicated in the letter to the NCC requesting authority from member countries for the Interim Regional Secretariat, on behalf of CT6 to enter into MOU with SEAFDEC.
19. The Meeting agreed to recognize the LRFFT Intergovernmental Forum as part of the CTI-CFF initiative pursuant to the CTI-CFF RPOA – Goal 2, Target 4
20. The Meeting confirmed support to initiate implementation of the LRFFT Resolution on LRFFT Intergovernmental Forum (adopted in the Bangkok meeting) and for the country focal points to report on progress vis-à-vis the action items outlined in the resolution in the subsequent EAFM TWG meetings or similar events as may be requested
21. The Meeting endorsed the concept proposal on the “Dialogue with the market side of the LRFFT”

**DAY TWO**

**Agenda Item 8: Payment for Ecosystem Services (PES) Initiatives on EAFM**

22. At the resumption of the EAFM TWG Meeting on Day Two, the Chair requested Dr. Robert Pomeroy to make the presentation on the Payment for Ecosystem Services (PES<sup>1</sup>) Initiatives on EAFM. Dr. Pomeroy informed the meeting that the PES presentation attached as [Annex 12](#) was prepared by Ms. Abbie Cruz-Trinidad who has been working on PES through the ADB Knowledge Management Project.
23. The Meeting noted that following the CTI-CFF Regional Plan of Action (RPOA), the plans for the implementation of PES is basically for fisheries-related initiatives as the text of Goal 2, Target 1, Regional Action 3 of the RPOA indicates: “Incorporate EAFM and payments for

---

<sup>1</sup> The PES outlined in the presentation is referred in the CTI-CFF RPOA as Payment for Environmental Services.

environmental services (PES) in bilateral and regional commitments on fisheries management, as well as other governmental agreements.”

24. The Meeting also agreed that the CT6 countries are in general new to or in the infancy stages of applying PES as an added/complementary tool in the fisheries management kit in their respective countries, and as such there is a need to learn further about PES and the ways and means for practical implementation.
25. The Meeting agreed to request assistance from partners to develop a more detailed information paper on PES which will include among others working examples of natural resources management regimes applying this PES approach found elsewhere.
26. The Meeting agreed to plan for future EAFM Regional Exchanges or Workshop to learn more about PES as well as to move forward the formulation of plans and strategies for the implementation of PES initiatives.

#### **Agenda Item 9: EAFM Indicators**

27. The Chair recognized two presenters to lead in the discussion of the EAFM Indicators. The first was Dr. Robert Pomeroy (with William Jatulan) who discussed the EAFM M&E Indicators and some actions needed from the EAFM TWG. The other was a case presentation on the development of EAFM indicators in Indonesia presented by Dr. Luky Adrianto. Both presentations are attached as [Annexes 13](#) and [14](#).
28. The Meeting noted the challenges of coming up with regional level EAFM indicators given the variability of reporting systems, different indices and various baselines used nationally and the capacity and reporting systems that are in place in each member country.
29. The Meeting noted that the EAFM TWG’s input/confirmation of the EAFM indicators is required by the 1<sup>st</sup> of July 2013 as basis in developing the CTI-CFF M&E Operations Manual.
30. The Meeting agreed to form a small group comprising of representatives from each country that were present to have a side meeting to discuss and develop recommendations to the Meeting on how to move forward with the EAFM Indicators.
31. Upon considering the findings and recommendations of the group (mentioned above), the Meeting decided on the following:
  - a) Agreed to delete indicators 2.2.3 and 2.2.4
  - b) Agreed to retain the rest of the indicators
  - c) Agreed to discuss in-country the “retained indicators” and to be followed with a discussion among CT6 to come up with a commonly agreed EAFM indicators
  - d) Agreed that the EAFM Chair will lead the CT6 discussions and to be completed/ submitted to the MEWG by mid-June 2013.

#### **Agenda Item 10: Present State of Knowledge on the Impacts of Climate and Ocean Change (COC) on Fisheries in the CT Region**

32. The Chair recognized Dr. Rusty Brainard of the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) to lead the presentation in this matter. There were two presentations made under this Agenda Item. The first was the discussion on the “Moving Toward Ecosystem-Based Coastal Area and Fisheries Management in the Coral Triangle: Integrated Strategies, Diagnostic and Guidance” providing a framework to integrate various tools to achieve the CTI-CFF goals. The second was a presentation on “Incorporating Climate and Ocean Change into an Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management (EAFM) Plan.” The presentation material on the latter is attached as [Annex 15](#) and the draft documents of the said guidelines are attached as [Annexes 16](#) and [17](#).
33. The Meeting endorsed the guidelines on “Incorporating Climate and Ocean Change into an Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management (EAFM) Plan” with a request to forward the Meeting Report from the Experts Workshop on March 2012 to the EAFM TWG Secretariat for reference.

#### **Agenda Item 11: IUU and Compliance and Enforcement**

34. The Chair recognized Mr. Godfery Kiskey of Malaysia and Dr. Robert Pomeroy to lead the presentations on this subject. Mr. Kiskey presented the outcomes from the Transboundary IUU workshop held on 22<sup>nd</sup> to 24<sup>th</sup> of January 2013 in Cebu, Philippines participated by Indonesia, Malaysia and the Philippines as well as partners from the ASEAN, Australia, US NOAA ([Annexes 18](#) and [19](#)) and other NGOs. Dr. Pomeroy’s presentation focused on the results of the assessment of local compliance and enforcement initiatives in four countries namely Malaysia, the Philippines, PNG and Solomon Islands ([Annex 20](#)).
35. The Meeting recognized and reaffirmed that there are on-going IUU Initiatives in the region under the RPOA IUU in which five of the six CTI countries are members. The Meeting agreed that any CTI-CFF activity pertaining to IUU as indicated in the CTI-CFF RPOA be pursued under the umbrella of the RPOA-IUU.
36. The Meeting is informed that Solomon Island has the status of observer only at RPOA-IUU meetings.
37. The Meeting requested that Solomon Islands (being as the only member of the CT6 not a member of the RPOA-IUU meetings) explore the possibility of joining in this RPOA-IUU group.
38. The Meeting adopted the recommendation arising from the IUU Workshop in Cebu that the CTI-CFF IUU initiatives focused on LRFFT regulation in the north Sabah (Malaysia) – Palawan (Philippines) be implemented and to be led by Malaysia in the initial planning process. It was noted that the LRFFT IUU was also part of the LRFFT Intergovernmental Forum Resolution adopted in Bangkok.
39. The Meeting agreed that Malaysia will follow up discussions with countries and partners (i.e. NOAA-Office of Law Enforcement) to clarify the concept note, funding support, etc. of the proposed follow up IUU meeting to be held in early September 2013.

40. The Meeting also agreed that any IUU initiative to be planned and implemented under the umbrella of the RPOA-IUU should be in line and in pursuance of the objectives of the CTI-CFF and the CTI-CFF RPOA. On this, the Meeting agreed that IUU initiatives should primarily address issues relating to LRFF and Turtles.
41. The Meeting agreed that the EAFM TWG Chair will request the RPOA IUU Secretariat to include CTI-CFF IUU initiatives into the Agenda of the RPOA-IUU Coordinating Committee Meeting scheduled for November 2013 in Kota Kinabalu, Malaysia. The Chair will circulate a draft concept paper to the CT6 EAFM Focal Points prior to the RPOA-IUU Coordinating Committee Meeting.

### **DAY THREE**

#### **Agenda Item 12: Plans for Transitioning of US CTI EAFM Regional Program and Products and Future Support for CTI-EAFM Activities<sup>2</sup>**

42. Following the resumption of the meeting on the third day, the Chair recognized Mr. Maurice Knight of the Coral Triangle Support Partnership (CTSP) and Mr. Eko Rudianto of the CTI-CFF Interim Regional Secretariat to brief on the transitioning of USCTI EAFM Regional Program and future support for CTI-CFF EAFM. The presentation material of the CTI-CFF Interim Regional Secretariat is attached as [Annex 21](#).
43. After the discussions, the Meeting noted the following:
- a) That the USCTI Support program will end by September 2013.
  - b) That the support from the US Government most probably will not take the form as was done by the current program. However, the US Government will continue supporting targeted programs through its regional initiative and bilateral missions. Discussions for further support are ongoing but no decisions are made yet.
  - c) That the EAFM TWG was encouraged by Mr. Knight to think about how to make use of the CT Atlas to store some of the spatial EAFM Indicators citing the example of the MPA indicators that comprise the Coral Triangle MPA System (CTMPAS).
  - d) That all the CT6 countries to consider programs and projects to be implemented in the US CTI post-transition phase, especially those that require support and funding from other partners.
  - e) That all countries have yet to finalize the lists of US CTI post-transition programs and project as their respective transition/integration/priority setting workshops/meetings are not yet conducted or completed.
  - f) The recommendations and suggestions by the Interim Regional Secretariat.
44. The Meeting agreed to prepare the next set of priorities for the upcoming Regional Priorities Workshop scheduled to be held in August 2013 in Manado, Indonesia. The agreed upon priorities will be used by CT6 countries as basis for moving forward EAFM activities beyond post-US CTI.

---

<sup>2</sup> This agenda item was moved to the third day.

45. The Meeting agreed that all CT6 countries will present their respective proposed list of US CTI post-transition projects and programs, including national and regional initiatives at the next TWG meeting. Member countries will also use this next EAFM TWG meeting as an initial programs' integration forum for the proposed list of US CTI post-transition programs and projects in the CT6 countries.

### **Agenda Item 13: Rotation of Chair and Co-chairs<sup>3</sup>**

46. The Chair as agreed in the Agenda Item 2, requested country representatives for proposals on the next EAFM TWG chairmanship based on the approved Terms of Reference. The Chair noted that the new Chair will assume responsibility by September 2013.

47. The Meeting unanimously agreed the proposal to designate Indonesia as the EAFM TWG Chair and Solomon Islands as the new Co-Chair with the Philippines (which retained its post as Co-Chair.) Both Indonesia and Solomon Islands accepted the posts respectively.

48. The CT6 representatives also reconfirmed the respective country representatives to the EAFM TWG as follows:

- a) Indonesia – Mr. Agus Budiman, Mr. Abdul Ghofar
- b) Malaysia – Mr. Rayner Stuel Galid, Mr. Johari bin Ramli
- c) PNG (to be confirmed)
- d) Philippines – Ms. Jessica Muñoz, Mr. Noel Barut
- e) Solomon Islands – Mr. James Teri, Mr. Peter Kenilorea
- f) Timor Leste – Mr. Fernando da Silva, Mr. Henrique Simao Barreto

### **Agenda Item 14: Any Other Business**

49. The Chair recognized Malaysia on its motion to thank the Government of Indonesia for the 3<sup>rd</sup> EAFM TWG Meeting. The Meeting unanimously endorsed the motion. The full text of the motion is attached as [Annex 22](#).

50. The Chair recognized the Philippines on its motion to thank the support partners in particular the US Government through the US CTI Support Program. The Meeting unanimously endorsed the motion. The full text of the motion is attached as [Annex 23](#).

51. The Meeting accepted the Philippines' offer to host the next EAFM TWG Meeting towards the end of the year to be tied up with SOM9.

### **CLOSING CEREMONIES**

52. Mr. Galid delivered a closing statement reiterating his deep gratitude to Indonesia, the host country for excellently hosting the meeting, the US CTI Support Program for its continued support and the CT6 country representatives for their active participation and productive

---

<sup>3</sup> Agenda items 13 and 14 were initially discussed on the second day but decisions were revisited on the third day following consultations made by CT6 representatives with their respective principals

contribution during the meeting. Mr. Galid summarized the key action items that need attention and follow up actions by the countries and the EAFM TWG Secretariat.

53. Mr. Galid noted that since the Meeting is running short of time to complete the minutes, the same will be then be adopted in the next EAFM TWG Meeting.

The Meeting adjourned at 11:50, 16<sup>th</sup> of May 2013.